

**Proceedings of the National Seminar on Indian and Western
Philosophy of Language
(10th to 12th February, 2011)**

A National Seminar on Indian and Western Philosophy of Language (10-12 February, 2011) jointly organised by Indira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts and Dept. of Vyakarana, S.V.D.V., B.H.U. was inaugurated on 10th February at 10.30 a.m. at Bharat Kala Bhavan, B.H.U. Prof. D. Prahladachara, Former Vice-Chancellor, Tirupati Rashtriya Sanskrit Vidyapeeth graced the occasion as President, while Prof. Karunasindhu Das, Vice-Chancellor, Rabindrabharati University, Kolkata, adorned the chair of Guest of Honour. During these three days, nineteen lectures were delivered by the expert professors coming from different parts of country which were attended every day by fifty eminent professors and scholars of B.H.U. and other Universities of Varanasi and outside.

Inaugural function of the programme was started at 10.30 a.m. on 10th February with the Vedic chanting of Prof. B.S. Shukla and a beautiful prayer to Universal Parents rendered by Dr. (Smt.) Svaravandana Sharma. After the lighting of lamp and floral tributes to Goddesses Sarasvati and Pt. Madan Mohan Malaviya, dignitaries on the dias were felicitated by Prof. D.P. Sharma, Director, Bharat Kala Bhavan, Prof. K.D. Tripathi, Advisor, IGNC, Varanasi, Prof. P.K. Mukhopadhyay, Senior Director, and Prof. R.C. Panda, Dean, Faculty of S.V.D.V., B.H.U.

Next to the floral felicitation formalities, Prof. R.C. Panda rendered welcome address to the galaxy of scholars assembled at Bharat Kala Bhavan. The Seminar opened with an inaugural message sent by Padmavibhushan Dr. Kapila Vatsyayana and presented by Prof. K.D. Tripathi. Prof. P.K. Mukhopadhyay in his keynote address presented "Problems and Prospects of Intercultural and Interdisciplinary Dialogues" as a canvas of this three-day colloquium on Philosophy of Language. Prof. K.S. Das, Vice-Chancellor, R.B.U., Kolkata as a Guest of Honour delivered a lecture on "Sphota Theory: A Response to the queries on Speech-Production and Speech Reception." Prof. Das in his Lecture remarked

that in India development of the Philosophy of Language was not a linear one; here it was evolved and manifested in divergent ways. In his abridged speech, starting from Vedas and Bhartrhari Prof. Das discussed the history of Philosophy of Language up to the 18th century in a lucid style. Next Prof. D. Prahladachar gave Presidential Address. Inaugural session ended with a vote of thanks rendered by Prof. K.D. Tripathi. Coordinator of this session was Prof. Bal Shastri, Head, Dept. of Vyakarana, S.V.D.V., B.H.U.

In the IInd Session, only one lecture was there on "Sphota Theory: Speech Production and Speech Reception" delivered by Prof. J. Ouseparampil. Prof. J.S.L. Tripathi, Prof. V.N. Jha and Prof. Navajyoti Singh discussed on this lecture. Prof. Godabarisha Mishra offered illuminating comments as a chair person. This session was coordinated by Prof. K.D. Tripathi.

In the IIIrd session, there were four speakers, viz. Prof. Gangadhar Kar, Prof. Navajyoti Singh, Prof. Rakesh Chandra and Prof. Sadhan Chakrabarty. Prof. Gangadhar Kar from Kolkata delivered his speech on "*Sabdikamate Satta*" from the stand point of Bhartrhari with special emphasis to Nyaya Darshana. Next Prof. Navajyoti Singh from Hyderabad delivered his lecture through powerpoint presentation on the "Concept of Being in the Grammatical Context". Through this lecture, Prof. Singh wanted to construct a bridge between Indian and Western Philosophy of Language.

Next to him, Prof. Rakesh Chandra from Lucknow and Prof. Sadhan Chakrabarti from Kolkata delivered their speeches on the "Understanding of Language: Autonomy and Creativity". Prof. Chakrabarti in his lecture presented Chomsky's views on the Creativity:Autonomy issue in the context of linguistic understanding whereas Rakesh Chandra presented Bhartrhari's views on the same topic. Prof. R.C. Pradhan, Prof. Godabarisha Mishra, Prof. Tantra Patnaik, etc. gave their comments on these lectures. Prof. J.S.L. Tripathi offered presidential remarks. This session was coordinated by Prof. P.K. Mukhopadhyay.

Next morning (11.2.11) the IVth session started at 10.00 a.m. at the Seminar Hall of S.V.D.V., B.H.U. with a very enlightening lecture of Prof. D. Prahladachar who told on *Sabdabodhprakriya*. In his illuminating speech, Prof. Prahladachar explained the procedure of verbal cognition with special reference to *akanksa* (expectancy) which is one of the three vital components of a sentence the other two being compatibility i.e. *yogyata* and proximity i.e. *sannidhi*. He defined these three factors and explained their important role in the procedure of verbal cognition. He showed further that among these three factors *akanksa* is most vital, through which sentential meaning is comprehended. Consequently he explained how Gangesopadhyaya refuted step by step his predecessor's definition of *akanksa* and finally himself has given the modified definition of the same (*upasthitetara-sabdasya-abhihitanaubhavaivatvapravajaka-virahapratiyogi-jnanavisayibhutarupavat padantara-samabhivyahrtatvam sakanksatvam*—Nyayadipa on Tarkatandava) and finally propagated that expectancy only generates sentential meaning. Prof. Sudhakar Dikshit, Prof. Gangadhar Kar, Dr. R.K. Pandey, Dr. Dhananjai Pandey raised many questions all of which were solved by the learned speaker. Next to him Dr. E.R. Narayanan from Hyderabad spoke on "Language-processing". Actually it was a joint presentation by Prof. Navajyoti Singh and Dr. E.R. Narayanan. Through powerpoint presentation these two scholars explained Language-processing and its various stages e.g. (1) Representational Approach to Verbal Meaning, (2) nine different punctuators, (3) formal ontology of verbs, etc. With ample quotations from Panini Sutras, Dr. Narayanan explained steps to Panini's derivation of Meaning. Many questions were raised to this lecture also, which were met by the Chairperson, Prof. V.N. Jha.

In continuation of this session, next speakers were Prof. Mithilesh Chaturvedi and Prof. Godabarisha Mishra who spoke on "Thought and Language". Prof. K.K. Sharma, Prof. D.N. Tiwari, Prof. R.C. Pradhan and Prof. Sadhan Chakrabarty discussed thoroughly different aspects of these Lectures. This session was jointly chaired over by Prof. Shreenarayan Mishra and Prof. P.K.

Mukhopadhyaya who offered illuminating comments upon these Lectures. Coordinator of this Session was Prof. Rajaram Shukla.

Vth Session started in the next half of the day, where speakers were four, viz. (1) Prof. Tantra Patnaik, (2) Prof. V. Kutumba Shastri, (3) Prof. R.C. Pradhan and (4) Prof. V.N. Jha. Prof. Tandra Patnaik from Puri delivered her speech on "Bhartrhari on Sentence Meaning" and Prof. Kutumb Shastri spoke on "Role of Tatparya in the Origination of Sentential Meaning". Next topic was "Nature of Relation between Language and Meaning" on which two papers were presented by Prof. R.C. Pradhan and Prof. V.N. Jha. At the end of four lectures Prof. Navjyoti Singh, Prof. Godabarisha Mishra, Prof. R.C. Panda, Prof. R.K. Tripathi, Prof. Sadhan Chakrabarti etc. took part in discussion and gave their remarks on these issues. Prof. D. Prahladachar and Prof. P.K. Mukhopadhyay offered illuminating comments in their Presidential Address. Coordinator of this session was Prof. K.D. Tripathi.

Next morning (12.2.11) VIth Session started with Prof. Dipti S. Tripathi's lecture on "Language and Reality". With a quotation from **Vakyapadiya** (I.114) she explained "Bhartrhari's Nature of Sabdatattva". Later on she continued to elaborate source of speech, type of language, use of language etc. In course of her speech she discussed two levels of language: (i) essence of language and (ii) articulated form of speech. While explaining gross (*vaikhari*) and subtle language (*suksma vak*) she remarked subtle language manifests itself in different ways and that is why different types of languages are evolved. In this context she presented Bhartrhari's explanation of *vivarta* and showed its difference from Sankara's definition on the same. Prof. A.K. Rai, Prof. V.N. Jha, Prof. N.N. Chakrabarti, Prof. J.S.L. Tripathi and Prof. B.S. Shukla discussed on this lecture. As a Chairperson, Prof. R.C. Panda gave some illuminating comments. This morning session was coordinated by Prof. D.N. Tiwari.

In the next half of the session Dr. T.S. Bhattacharya, Prof. N.N. Chakrabarti from Kolkata presented their papers on "Sentence and Word: The Importance of

Question of Primacy". Last speaker of this session was Prof. D.N. Tiwari who spoke on "Linguistic Communication". After this deliberation, Prof. Dipti S. Tripathi and Prof. R.B. Mishra took part in discussion. Prof. P.K. Mukhopadhyay gave presidential remarks over all the papers of this session. This session was coordinated by Prof. Rajaram Shukla.

Valedictory function started at 3.30 p.m. which was presided over by well-known Sanskritist Prof. Bhagirath Prasad Tripathi (Vagisha Shastri). In this function, Prof. G.N. Samten, Vice-Chancellor, C.U.H.T.S., Sarnath adorned the chair of Chief Guest. The function started with Vedic chanting by Dr. Patanjali Mishra. After the offering of floral tributes to Sarasvati by the guests, Prof. R.C. Panda delivered welcome address to the assembled guests. Next, Prof. K.D. Tripathi, Prof. P.K. Mukhopadhyay and Prof. R.C. Panda offered floral felicitation to the dignitaries on the dias. Consequently Prof. S.M. Mishra from Kurukshetra presented a resume of the Seminar papers before the chief guest.

Prof. G.N. Samten while speaking as a Chief Guest, remarked that since long ago Philosophers of different systems of Indian Philosophy have been continuing their dialogue with each other and through this interaction Nyaya, Samkhya, Vedanta, Buddhist and Jain schools of Philosophy have been influenced and enriched by each other. In that sense to organise such type of seminar as an aggressive step to the interaction between Indian and Western Philosophy is very much pertinent. Prof. Vagisha Shastri gave presidential address on this occasion. The programme ended with vote of thanks rendered by Prof. K.D. Tripathi. This session was coordinated by Dr. Pranati Ghosal.

(Pranati Ghosal)