

A Brief Account of the Three-weeks' Workshop on Textual Criticism and Editing of Manuscripts (9.11.2010 to 30.11.2010)

A three weeks' workshop on Textual Criticism and Editing of Manuscripts was organized jointly by Indira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts, Eastern Regional Centre, Varanasi and National Mission for Manuscripts, New Delhi, at Parshvanath Vidyapeeth, Karaundi, Varanasi. In this programme, apart from the academic staff of IGNCA, Varanasi and two members from NMM, about twenty external members belonging to Sanskrit Department, B.H.U. and S.V.D.V., B.H.U., Sampurnanand Sanskrit University, M.G. Kashi Vidyapeeth participated to learn Ancient Indian Scripts and Principles of Text Editing.

The inaugural programme of the Workshop started with chanting of Vedic hymns by the students of Paṭṭābhirāma Shastri Veda Mīmāṃsā Anusandhāna Kendra. In the holy atmosphere, sanctified by the resonance of Vedic chanting Prof. K.D. Tripathi rendered welcome address to the assembled guests. Dr. V.S. Shukla from N.M.M., New Delhi, introduced the outline of the workshop in a brief note. Chief Guest Prof. B.M. Shukla, former, V.C. Gorakhpur University in his address remarked that manuscripts are priceless treasure of our country. He emphasized on proper maintenance and conservation of this treasure. In this context he focused on the pertinence of teaching different scripts like Newarī, Śāradā for the indepth study of manuscripts, esp. for the task of editing. In order to explain relevance of this workshop, Prof. G.C. Tripathi told the necessity of editing important texts on Polity, Medicine, Astrology and Silpa Shastra for the reconstruction of cultural history of India. Prof. R.C. Panda, Dean, Faculty of S.V.D.V., B.H.U. in his presidential address discussed the importance of organizing workshop on textual criticism not only for the proper maintenance of important texts but also for revival and reconstruction of our cultural heritage. This inaugural programme ended with vote of thanks extended by Prof. S.L. Jain, Director, Parshvanath Vidyapeeth.

The activities of the three weeks' Workshop may be divided under three main heads:

1. Revising lesson of Śāradā and Newarī scripts taught in the previous workshop;
2. A series of lectures on the Principles of Editing texts of various disciplines, and
3. Practical sessions of transcription, collation and editing of selected manuscripts.

On the one hand two very important scripts viz. Śāradā and Newarī were taught by expert teachers to revise previous year's lesson on these scripts. Prof. V.V. Jaddipal from Tirupati and Prof. Prakash Chandra Pandey, Principal, G.N. Jha Central Research Institute, Allahabad, joined this programme to teach Śāradā. Dr. Anirvan Dash from C.I.H.T.S., Sarnath and Prof. Ratna Basu from Kolkata taught Newarī. Apart from teaching the graphics of Śāradā and Newarī scripts, they gave rich lectures on these subjects in which they explained (1) historical background, (2) Origin, and (3) development of these scripts, (4) their special characteristics, (5) varieties of tools and (6) method of preparing model texts by using the Mss of different scripts.

Another facet of this workshop was a series of lectures on the Principles of Textual Criticism. The Workshop opened with a lecture delivered by Prof. G.C. Tripathi, former Head, Kalākośa Division on "Selection of Manuscripts to prepare a Critical Edition". At the outset he gave a rich introduction on Manuscriptology and defined it according to its derivative components of Latin origin. The word is derived from Latin *manus* means hand with 5th case ending and *scriptu* (another Latin term) means 'to write'. As a whole it means the document written with hand is called manuscript; and the science dealing with every dimension and aspects of manuscripts is called Manuscriptology. In course of his lecture, he discussed on various materials of Mss (e.g. palm leaf, paper, metal plate, stone, wooden plank etc), writing materials and tools according to the nature of manuscript. He also

explained the term *pustaka* and *grantha* (*grathanāt granthaḥ*). Later on he explained how to select manuscripts, how to classify the copies, how to determine their nature, etc. With a quotation from Nālakaṇṭhī Tīkā on MBh (*bahūn samahr̥tya vibhinnadeśyān kośān samālocya ca pāṭhyam agryam / prācāṃ gurūṇām anusṛtya vācam ārabhyate bhāratabhāvādīpaḥ //*), he discussed different principles of editing mentioned by our ancient *ācāryas*. He also focused on the prerequisites for being an editor. The person who undertakes the task of editing he should be conversant with (1) the script as well as the language in which the text is written, (2) should have a fair knowledge of the concerned subject, and (3) should be fairly acquainted with technical terms which are frequently used in the text. In course of his lecture Prof. Tripathi threw light on the reasons of errors crept in the text and how to find those out.

Prof. G.C. Tripathi's second lecture was on "the Process of Preparing Critical Edition of an ṛgama text as well as Illustrated texts." He explained that as because ṛgama texts were not composed by a single hand, most probably they were written by different persons of same tradition; stylistic difference also may be noticed in these texts; therefore before undertaking the task of editing (an ṛgama text) thorough study of the subject from an expert *guru* becomes essential. Further, in order to become acquainted with secrets and code of conducts of a specific tradition, initiation in that tradition becomes another necessity. Familiarity with technical terminology of the concerned school is also another vital factor. In course of his lecture, Prof. Tripathi discussed the methods which should be followed and which should be avoided at the time of editing an ṛgama text (e.g.), he should avoid (i) unnecessary corrections (esp. grammatical) and (ii) making changes of reading according to his own choice.

In the next part of his lecture he concentrated on the techniques of editing illustrated manuscripts and required qualifications of an editor of this trend. For this task the editor should have not only a thorough knowledge in the History of Arts (in general) but also about History of Painting School of that specific region where this illustrated text was written and painted; (ii) an overall knowledge about

the dress code and style of ornaments of that region, (iii) use of colour and other painting materials conventional in that part of country. Prof. Tripathi told that in these texts, text portion is not so much important but to relate the painted portion with text material properly is the main concern.

Dr. V.S. Shukla gave two lectures on (i) Important collections of Mss. In India and abroad, and (ii) History of writing tradition in India.

Dr. Prakash Chandra Pandey from Allahabad told Origin and Development of Śāradā Script. Along with this lecture, he showed the students the evolution of the graphics of Śāradā alphabets and he made them to practice, decipherment and transcription from the mss. of Śāradā script.

Dr. V.V. Jaddipal delivered two lectures on (1) Methodology of transcription of Manuscripts, and (2) Importance of Study of Metrics to prepare a model text; and as a practical lesson of his first lecture he made the student to decipher and transcribe an entire chapter of *Kirātārjunīyam* written in Śāradā script.

Dr. Smt. Subhadra Desai delivered two lectures on Technical Terminologies used in Musical Treatises with Special Reference to Nāṭyaśāstra. In her illustrated talk, Dr. Smt. Desai explained various components of Music, viz. (1) *nāda*, (2) *śruti*, (3) *svara*, (4) *vādī*, (5) *samavādī*, (6) *anuvādī*, (7) *jāti*, (8) *grāma*, (9) *mūrchanā*, (10) *nyāsa*, (11) *rāga*, (12) *tāla*, (13) *laya*, (14) *ātodya*, (15) *mārga*, (16) *deśī*, (17) *karaṇa*, and (18) *sthāna*. She discussed all these terminologies according to their derivation and highlighted their definition, nature and classification.

Dr. Jeetendra Bhai Shah from Ahmedabad delivered four lectures on (1) History of Jain Manuscripts, their availability sites, (2) History of Jain Literature, its various branches and author/Exponents, (3) Problems of Editing Jain texts, and (4) Connotation of different indicatory marks (*sanketa*) used in the MSS and Means of determining the date of MS with the aid of these works.

Prof. Vasant Kumar Bhatt from Gujarat University, Ahmedabad, delivered a series of lectures with the aid of slide show and Power-Point presentation on (1)

Various facets of Lower criticism, (2) Different stages of lower criticism, (3) How to determine pedigree of texts and prepare genealogical tree of Mss, and (4) Principles of Higher Criticism with special reference to the critical editions of *Bhagavadgītā*, *Uttararāmacarita* and Bengali Recension of *Abhijñāna Śākuntalam*.

Prof. K.D. Tripathi gave three lectures on (1) A Survey of the available recensions of Nāṭyaśāstra, (2) Need to Revisit the Textual Traditions and (3) Fundamental Principles of Editing as referred to by Ancient śāstras like Abhinavagupta, etc.

Prof. Rajaram Shukla delivered two lectures on (1) History of Manuscript Collection of Sarasvati Bhavan Library and (2) Problems of Editing Philosophical texts and its prerequisites on the part of editor.

Prof. R.C. Panda gave two lectures on the Importance of Grammatical Knowledge for being an editor with special reference to (1) *Kāraṅga* and (2) *Samāsa* rules.

Prof. R.C. Pandey delivered lectures on (1) Tradition of Astronomy and Mathematics in India and Textual Tradition preserved in Manuscripts, and (2) Techniques to be followed in editing Mathematical Texts.

Prof. Y.K. Mishra in his lectures explained (1) The nature of vast range of Vedic Literature, its six branches and (2) Various challenges before the editor of a Vedic Manuscript.

Prof. S.L. Jain in his elaborated talk gave (1) a general introduction to the History of Jaina Literature, (2) Description of vast Mss. collection in the custody of P.V. Institute and (3) Their special features, varieties of materials, etc.

The third facet of workshop was its long practical sessions of (a) transcription, (b) collation of available copies of Mss. and (2) editing of the same on the basis of collated materials.

This practical work of collation and editing work was accomplished in two segments under the guidance of Prof. R.C. Pandey and Prof. Ratna Basu.

With the help of nine sets of Mss of Nāṭyaśāstra, Prof. Ratna Basu from Kolkata instructed the participants how to collate the sets of Mss and how to edit

the text on the basis of same. The participants accomplished the job of collating and editing two chapters (13th and 14th) of Nāṭyaśāstra under her competent instruction.

Prof. R.C. Pandey selected three small treatises on Mathematics and Astrology, viz. (1) Gaṇita Prakāśa, (2) Mayūracitraka, and (3) Vāsturājavallabha. The participants completed the task of collating and editing of these texts under his able guidance.

Sri C.R. Gharekhan, President, IGNCA Trust, as a part of his gracious visit to IGNCA, ERC, Varanasi, took a round of the Workshop on 22nd November and observed the academic pursuit continuing therein.

Prof. Dipti Tripathi, Director, National Mission for Manuscripts, New Delhi, paid a visit to the Workshop on 27th and 28th November, to inspire the participants.

The Workshop ended with a Valedictory function on 30th November, 2010, in the gracious presence of Prof. B.D. Singh, Rector B.H.U. The programme started with Vedic chanting by the students of Paṭṭābhirāma Shastri Veda Mīmāṃsā Anusandhāna Kendra. Prof. K.D. Tripathi, Advisor, IGNCA, Varanasi felicitated the dignitaries with floral tributes and delivered welcome address to the assembled guests. Dr. N.D. Tiwari presented a brief summary of lectures delivered in the sessions of the Workshop. Certificates were distributed among the participants by Chief Guest, Prof. B.D. Singh. Later on he gave a valedictory address also. Prof. S.L. Jain gave Presidential remarks on the sessions of Workshop. The programme ended with vote of thanks extended by Dr. Pranati Ghosal.

(Pranati Ghosal)